

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

-----X  
GINA ANNE NOEL PANE,

Plaintiff

Case No.: 07 CV 3216  
(WP4) (CMS)

-against-

THE TOWN OF GREENBURGH, JOHN KAPCIA,  
in his capacity as Chief of the Greenburgh Police  
Department, ERIK WARD, POLICE OFFICER  
MICHAEL MUESSER, SERGEANT ROBERT  
GRAMAGLIA, SERGEANT FRANCIS PUMILLO,  
DETECTIVE PAUL FERTIG, JOHN DOE POLICE  
OFFICERS 1-10 so named as their identifies have  
yet to be established,

ANSWER

Defendants.  
-----X

The Defendants, Michael Muesser, Sergeant Robert Gramaglia, Sergeant Francis  
Pumillo, Detective Fertig and John Doe Police Officers 1-10, by their attorney, Thomas J.  
Troetti, Esq., answering the Complaint states as follows:

FIRST: Denies knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the  
allegations set forth at those paragraphs designated "11," "14," "23," "26," "27," "50,"  
"52," "53," "54," "65," "66," "67," "68," "69," "71," "73," "100," "107," "108," "109,"  
"114," "115," "116," "117," "119," "120,"

SECOND: Denies the allegations of those paragraphs designated "2," "3," "4,"  
"5," "25," "28," "29," "30," "31," "32," "33," "34," "36," "37," "38," "39," "40," "41,"  
"42," "43," "44," "45," "47," "49," "55," "56," "57," "58," "59," "60," "61," "62," "63,"  
"64," "70," "72," "74," "75," "76," "77," "78," "80," "81," "82," "83," "85," "86," "87,"

“88,” 90,” “91,” “92,” “93,” 95,” “96,” “97,” “99,” “101,” “102,” “104,” “106,” “111,”  
“124,” 127,” 128,” “130,” “131,” “133,” “135,” “136,” “137,”

THIRD: Denies knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the allegations set forth at those paragraphs designated “1,” “6,” “7,” “8,” “9,” “10,” “15,” “21,” “22,” “25,” “47,” “48,” “121 and leaves all questions of law to the Court.

FOURTH: Admits the allegations of those paragraphs designated “12,” “13,” “24,” “46,”

FIFTH: Denies the allegations of those paragraph designated “16,” “17,” “18,” “19,” and “20” except to admit that Police Officer Muesser, Sergeant Robert Gramaglia, Sergeant Francis Pumillo, Detective Fertig and Police Officers John Does 1-10 were at the time of the events alleged in the Complaint employed by and working under the authority of the Town of Greenburgh.

SIXTH: Denies the allegations of paragraph “35” except to admit that Ms. Pane was transported by Police Office Muesser, in a Greenburgh Police Department vehicle, to Greenburgh Police Headquarters.

SEVENTH: Admits the allegations of paragraph “103” and “110” “129” but allege that the arresting officer did not need an arrest warrant.

EIGHT: Denies the allegations of paragraph “113” but alleges that based on a legally sufficient basis the plaintiff was arrested and subject to prosecution.

NINTH: Denies the allegations of paragraph “122” except to admit that all relevant times mentioned the answering defendants were acting in the scope of their employment as police officers employed by the defendant, Town of Greenburgh.

TENTH: Denies the allegations of paragraph "125" except to admit that the extent of physical contact with the plaintiff was limited to that necessary to arrest the plaintiff and process her.

ELEVENTH: Denies the allegations of paragraph "126" except to admit that when the plaintiff was arrested she was handcuffed.

TWELFTH: Denies the allegations of paragraph "132" except to admit that the plaintiff's consent was not required to arrest and process her.

EIGHT: The answering defendants repeat and reallage those allegations of the Answer to those paragraphs of the Complaint designated as "79," "84," "89," "94," 98," 105," "112," "118," "123," and "134."

**AS AND FOR A FIRST  
AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE**

Any detention or arrest of the plaintiff was justified.

**AS AND FOR A SECOND  
AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE**

There was probable cause for the plaintiff's arrest.

**AS AND FOR A THIRD  
AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE**

The defendants, Police Officer Michael Muesser, Sergeant Robert Gramaglia, Sergeant Francis Pumillo, Detective Fertig and "John Doe" Police Officers 1-10 at all times acted in good faith and are protected from liability by qualified immunity.

**AS AND FOR A FOURTH  
AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE**

The plaintiff's state law claims are barred by the applicable statute of limitations.



**AS AND FOR A FIFTH  
AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE**

Any acts of these answering defendants which are alleged to have negligently caused any physical injury and/or emotional distress were caused by the plaintiff's own culpable conduct.

**AS AND FOR A CROSS-CLAIM AGAINST  
THE DEFENDANT, TOWN OF GREENBURGH**

Pursuant to the Public Officer Law section 18 the defendant, Town of Greenburgh, is required to indemnify these answering defendants against any adverse judgment obtained by the plaintiff arising out of the scope of the answering defendants' employment, which acts alleged by the plaintiff as the basis of liability these answering defendants deny.

WHEREFORE, the answering defendants demand judgment dismissing the Complaint, together with the costs and disbursements of this action.

DATED: White Plains, New York  
June 19, 2007

Yours, Etc.,

s/  
THOMAS J. TROETTI (7184)  
Attorney for Defendants,  
POLICE OFFICER MICHAEL MUESSER,  
SERGEANT ROBERT GRAMAGLIA,  
SERGEANT FRANCIS PUMILLO,  
DETECTIVE PAUL FERTIG, JOHN DOE  
POLICE OFFICERS 1-10 so named as their  
identifies have yet to be established,  
305 Old Tarrytown Road  
White Plains, New York 10603  
(914) 946-1875

TO: The Law Firm of Ravi Batra, P.C.  
Attorneys for GINA ANNE NOEL PANE  
142 Lexington Avenue  
The Batra Building  
New York, New York 10016

STECICH, MURPHY AND LAMMERS, LLP  
Attorneys for Defendants  
TOWN OF GREENBURGH and  
JOHN KAPICA, Chief of Police  
828 South Broadway, Suite 201  
Tarrytown, New York 10591

QUINN& MELEA,  
Attorney for Defendant,  
ERIK WARD  
399 Knollwood Road  
White Plains, New York 10603